

Citizens Coinage Advisory Committee

801 Ninth Street, NW, Washington, DC 20220

CCAC

Citizens Coinage Advisory Committee
Public Meeting
Tuesday, September 22, 2009, 9 AM
United States Mint Headquarters
801 9th Street, NW, 2nd Floor
Washington, DC 20001

In attendance:

John Alexander
Doreen Bolger
Michael Brown
Arthur Houghton
Gary Marks
Rick Meier
Mitch Sanders (Chairperson)
Donald Scarinci
Joe Winter (via telephone)

1. The chair called the meeting to order at 9 AM.
2. Kaarina Budow of the United States Mint presented candidate designs for the 2010 issues of the America the Beautiful Quarters program. As part of this program, the United States Mint will mint and issue 56 circulating quarter-dollar coins with reverse designs emblematic of a national park or other national site in each state and territory. Quarters will be issued sequentially in the order in which the featured sites were established as national sites.
3. Ms Budow explained that the United States Mint works with Superintendents' offices with respect to guidance on appropriate images and source materials for artists.
4. Ms Budow indicated that the coins' obverse would feature a restored version of the 1932 bust of George Washington, originally by John Flanagan, with greater relief and enhanced details.
5. Several members expressed disappointment that the committee's recommendation to portray Theodore Roosevelt on the quarter's obverse for the duration of the America the Beautiful Quarters Program was not implemented. United States Mint staff explained to the committee that in the absence of any mandate for change from the Secretary of the Treasury or the United States Congress, the existing obverse design (in a modified version) was retained.
6. Committee members rated proposed designs by assigning 0, 1, 2, or 3 points to each, with higher points reflecting more favorable evaluations. With nine members present and voting, the maximum possible point total was 27.

7. For the coin representing Hot Springs National Park in Arkansas, members appreciated the sense of perspective on Arkansas design 1, though the design was overall considered to be too intricate for the small palette of a coin, as was design 3. Design 4 was appreciated for its inclusion of natural landscape, and for its clear focus on the fountain as the site's primary attraction.
8. For Arkansas the committee recommended design 4, which received 24 points. Design 3 received 11 points.
9. For the coin representing Yellowstone National Park in Wyoming, members criticized the representation of Old Faithful on design 3 as unrealistic, and felt that the lodge in design 2 distracted from the geyser. Members generally spoke highly of design 1, for its inclusion of the parks' wildlife as a complement to the iconic geyser image.
10. For Wyoming the committee recommended design 1, which received 25 points. Design 2 received 5 points.
11. For the coin representing Yosemite National Park in California, the inclusion of wildlife on designs 1 and 2 held some appeal, but in general these designs were considered excessively busy for a coin. Between the two images of El Capitan on designs 3 and 4, design 3 was considered bolder and more interesting.
12. For California the committee recommended design 3, which received 18 points. Design 2 received 11 points.
13. For the coin representing Grand Canyon National Park in Arizona, discussion centered around designs 1 and 4, which offered the clearest depictions of the majesty of the canyon. Although there was some concern that the person walking along the trail would be so small as to be indistinct, design 1 appealed to many committee members for its up-close, human-scaled depiction of the canyon.
14. For Arizona the committee recommended design 1, which received 21 points. Design 4 received 17 points.
15. For the coin representing Mount Hood National Forest in Oregon, several members were adamantly opposed to the inclusion of the Portland skyline, which was considered to detract from the image of Mount Hood. The view of the mountain on designs 3 and 4 was preferred to that on designs 1 and 2, though the rhododendron on design 4 was considered to be extraneous.
16. For Oregon the committee recommended design 3, which received 27 points. Designs 1 and 4 each received 3 points.
17. Ms Budow then presented proposed designs for the 2010 First Spouse Gold Coins and Medals, honoring Abigail Fillmore, Jane Pierce, James Buchanan's Liberty, and Mary Todd Lincoln.
18. Discussion of First Spouse obverse designs focused mostly on the historical accuracy of the portraits as images contemporary with each Presidency. When considering First Spouse reverse designs, committee members generally expressed support for historically accurate depictions of serious subjects, focusing when possible on the subject's life and work outside the White House.
19. Historical accuracy was a subject of specific discussion for the Mary Todd Lincoln coin. The CCAC's historian, John Alexander, expressed serious concern that Design 1, showing Mrs. Lincoln bandaging a wounded soldier, and Design 2,

- showing President and Mrs. Lincoln greeting an African-American family at the White House, were historically inaccurate.
20. For James Buchanan's coin, there was little support for any of the reverse designs presented.
21. The committee's recommendations for First Spouse designs were as follows:

Abigail Fillmore Obverse (maximum 24):

Design 3, 13 points

Design 2, 8 points

Abigail Fillmore Reverse (maximum 24):

Design 5, depicting Mrs. Fillmore in the White House library she established, 21 points

Design 1, depicting Mrs. Fillmore teaching, 8 points

Jane Pierce Obverse (maximum 24):

Design 1, 24 points

Design 5, 2 points

Jane Pierce Reverse (maximum 24):

Design 3, showing Mrs. Pierce listening to Senate Debate, 21 points

Design 1, showing Mrs. Pierce listening to Senate Debate, 9 points

James Buchanan's Liberty Obverse (maximum 24):

Design 1, based on the quarter-eagle issued from 1840 to 1907, 19 points

James Buchanan Reverse (maximum 24):

Design 4, depicting Buchanan as Minister to Russia, 7 points

Design 1, depicting Buchanan with Harriet Lane in the White House, 4 points

Mary Todd Lincoln Obverse (maximum 21):

Design 5, 14 points

Design 4, 10 points

Mary Todd Lincoln Reverse (maximum 21):

Design 2, portraying Mrs. Lincoln visiting wounded soldiers with flowers and books, 21 points

Design 3, portraying Mrs. Lincoln showing newly installed White House wallpaper, 5 points

22. There being no further business, the chair adjourned the meeting at 12:25 PM.