

Citizens Coinage Advisory Committee

801 Ninth Street, NW, Washington, DC 20220



Citizens Coinage Advisory Committee Public Meeting

Tuesday, November 13 2007
United States Mint Headquarters
801 9th Street, NW, 8th Floor
Washington, DC

In attendance:

John Alexander
Michael Brown
Bill Fivaz
Arthur Houghton
Rita Laws (by telephone)
Gary Marks
Richard Meier
Mitch Sanders (chair)
Donald Scarinci
S. Joseph Winter

1. The chair called the meeting to order at 9:20 A.M.
2. The committee considered proposed designs for the 2009 Abraham Lincoln Commemorative Coin Program. As specified by Public Law 109-285, the United States Mint shall issue \$1 silver coins that shall be emblematic of the life and legacy of President Abraham Lincoln.
3. Kaarina Budow of the United States Mint presented proposed designs to the committee. She explained that in developing the designs for Lincoln's image on the obverse, artists were asked to consider depicting Lincoln as in his last studio photograph portrait taken by Alexander Gardner in 1865, or during his delivery of the Gettysburg Address, or as depicted by Daniel Chester French's statue of Lincoln located in the Lincoln Memorial.
4. Ms Budow also explained that the coin's reverse is intended to reflect President Lincoln's life and legacy as depicted through his words and ideals. Artists were asked to consider the idea of democracy Lincoln expressed in the closing to the Gettysburg Address.
5. After a question from Mr Scarinci, Ms Budow clarified that the instructions to artists were expressed as suggestions, not as requirements.
6. Ms Budow indicated that for the coin's obverse, the Abraham Lincoln Bicentennial Commission preferred design LC-O-06, which is a rendering of the

- Gardner studio portrait from 1865. According to Ms Budow, the Lincoln Commission felt that this design best captured the physical strain Lincoln experienced during the war, and also had a slight hint of an enigmatic smile.
7. Mr Scarinci then moved that the CCAC should reject all of the designs presented. Mr Scarinci argued that the designs before the committee, which were based on pre-existing images of Lincoln, were not consistent with Mint Director Moy's call for a Neo-Renaissance of American numismatic art.
 8. After some discussion, the committee voted 9-1 to table Mr Scarinci's motion.
 9. The committee then proceeded to discuss proposed obverse designs. As part of the discussion, several members expressed a belief that designs LCO-O-06 or LCO-O-07 would work well on the upcoming (2010) Presidential Dollar portraying Lincoln.
 10. At the conclusion of the discussion, it was decided that the committee would proceed to discuss the proposed reverse designs before voting on the obverse.
 11. Ms Budow indicated that design LCO-R-02, featuring the final 43 words of the Gettysburg Address, was the preference of the Abraham Lincoln Bicentennial Commission.
 12. The committee's discussion of the proposed reverses focused on the two designs with an extended quotation from the Gettysburg Address: LCO-R-02 and LCO-R-09. Many members considered Lincoln's powerful words to be a highly appropriate design for the coin's reverse. Other members expressed concern that a reverse dominated by words would be lacking in artistic merit, though Mr Alexander suggested that the words themselves were a form of art.
 13. Members rated designs using a numerical scale from zero to three, where zero represents the lowest rating, and three represents the highest rating. The design receiving the highest point total is the committee's recommendation. With nine members voting (one member was present but did not vote), the maximum possible total is 27 points.
 14. For the coin's reverse, the CCAC recommends design LCO-R-09, which received 18 points out of a maximum of 27. This design features an extended quotation from Lincoln's Gettysburg Address along with allegorical figures from the Soldiers Monument at Gettysburg. The committee's second choice, with 13 points, was design LCO-R-02, and also carries the same quotation.
 15. For the coin's obverse, the CCAC recommends design LCO-O-06, which received 12 points out of a maximum of 27. Design LCO-O-06 displays a forward-facing image of Lincoln from the 1865 photograph by Gardner. Members generally considered this design to be a powerful and evocative image of Lincoln. The committee's second choice was design LCO-O-04, which received 9 points, and which shows an upward view of the statue of Lincoln located in the Lincoln Memorial.
 16. After a break for lunch, the committee had some preliminary discussion of its Annual Report for Fiscal Year 2007, in preparation for a fuller and more specific discussion at the committee's next meeting.
 17. There being no further business, the chair adjourned the meeting at 12:50 PM.

