

January 24, 2006
Citizens Coinage Advisory Committee

Public meeting
United States Mint Headquarters
801 9th Street, NW
2nd Floor
Washington, DC

Present:

John Alexander
Leon Billings
Bill Fivaz
Rita Laws (via telephone)
Mitch Sanders
Donald Scarinci
Ken Thomasma
S. Joseph Winter
Ute Wartenberg Kagan

1. Chairman Mitch Sanders called the meeting to order at 9:30 am.
2. All members of the Committee were sworn in by Acting Director David Lebryk.
3. By motion duly made by Leon Billings and seconded by Bill Fivaz, the minutes of the meeting held on November 15, 2005 were unanimously approved. The letter to the Secretary was noted.
4. Chairman Mitch Sanders announced that he has appointed as members of the Executive Committee Donald Scarinci, who will also act as Vice Chairman, and Ute Wartenberg Kagan as Secretary.
5. Kaarina Budow, Program Analyst, Sales and Marketing, of the United States Mint presented proposed designs for the 2007 issues of the 50 State Quarters Program.

The committee evaluated designs using a procedure whereby each member assigned each design a rating of 0, 1, 2, or 3 points, with higher numbers indicating higher ratings. The committee's overall preference was calculated by summing the ratings of all members. With 9 members present and voting, the resulting scale ranges from a minimum of 0 points to a maximum of 27 points.

The following comments were made on the four designs for the reverse of the Montana quarter:

- MT-1 Bull Elk in an open landscape with the rising sun: Members commented on the fact that the sun was rising over the western mountains, which was not correct. The design was generally popular with most members.
- MT-2 Bison skull over a landscape, with the inscription BIG SKY COUNTRY: Committee member Leon Billings, a native of Montana, explained to the committee about the power of this symbol in the state's history, and that this design, in his view, most captured the state. Members also thought that the large image would translate well onto a quarter coin.
- MT-3 State outline with landscape and a rising sun: This design was not popular with the committee, which is generally averse to state outlines.
- MT-4 A landscape with river and mountains; in the sky the inscription BIG SKY COUNTRY: Some members thought that this image was representative of the Montana landscape, others thought that it was not powerful enough. There were also concerns about how it would translate into the small size of a coin.

Design MT-2, with the bison skull, was the committee's top recommendation with 25 out of a possible 27 points. The other votes were MT-1 with 13 points, MT-3 with 4 points, and MT-4 with 9 points.

The following comments were made on the designs for the state of Washington.

- WA-1 Salmon, Mount Rainier and an apple within an outline of the state: CCAC members disliked this design, which was considered too cluttered and busy. Committee members generally agreed that designs featuring a collage of various elements are not successful.
- WA-2 A salmon breaching the water with Mount Rainier as a backdrop: members strongly endorsed this theme, which was seen as attractive and significant for the state. It was suggested to remove the drops of splashing water, and perhaps to replace the small waves with a few simple lines to indicate the water's surface. Some members expressed concern about the accuracy of the salmon's appearance.
- WA-3 A Northwest Native American stylized orca: undoubtedly this design was the most controversial considered during the meeting. Most members thought that it was fundamentally flawed -- resembling a cartoonish airplane -- and was far too simplistic. Three members expressed admiration for this theme, while others supported the idea of Native American art, but using a very different design.

Design WA-2 was the committee's most preferred, with 24 points out of a possible 27. WA-1 received 0 points, and WA-3 received 8 points.

Four design suggestions were presented for the Idaho quarter.

- ID-1 A Peregrine Falcon, with a state outline and the state motto ESTO PERPETUA (“May it Be Forever”): Members liked the strong design of the falcon head, but felt strongly that the state outline detracted from the overall design. Most members felt that the state outline should be removed, and two members felt that it should at least be reduced in size. It was also noted that the star indicating the location of the capital Boise was unnecessary and probably unrecognizable in reduced size on the quarter. It was requested that the design of bird and outline, if chosen, should be more balanced and leave less space of the right side of the field
- ID-2 Sawtooth Mountains with a river ending in the shape of the state outline; ESTO PERPETUA below: It was questioned whether the mountainous landscape was representative of the agricultural state of Idaho. However, most members expressed admiration for a clever incorporation of the state outline.
- ID-3 Farmland Tapestry; ESTO PERPETUA: This theme was considered appropriate for Idaho’s vast fields but the execution of lines with mountains was viewed as far too cluttered and difficult to render in relief on a small coin.
- ID-4 State outline with flower and state song And Here We Have Idaho/Winning Her Way To Fame: Most committee members think of state outlines as unflattering. Although some members thought that on this coin the design was perhaps acceptable, it was generally agreed that it was still too busy.

Designs ID-1 and ID-2 were in a tie for the first place, both receiving 19 out of 27 possible points. Design ID-3 received 9 points, and ID-4 received 7 points.

The central theme for designs for Wyoming was a bucking horse and a rider. Member Ken Thomas from Wyoming thought that this theme was the likely final choice of the state, as it was so emblematic for Wyoming. Comments on the proposals for Wyoming were as follows.

- WY-1 Bucking Horse and Rider in silhouette style with the motto THE EQUALITY STATE: There was much discussion about this unusual technique, which would be new to the state quarter program if chosen. Members were keen to know from the US Mint employees how the difference between the rider and the remaining surface would differ to achieve a silhouette effect. Members agreed that this could be an innovative quarter if such a difference in texture could be created.
- WY-2 Bucking Horse and Rider – in relief, with state motto in a state outline. Some members did not think that the state outline with the state motto was a successful design element.

- WY-3. Bucking Horse and Rider, with Teton mountain range in the background. Members thought that the mountains in the background were inadequately rendered.
- WY-4 Bucking Horse and Rider, in a typical Wyoming scene. Overall, this theme –though conventional- was seen as authentic and successful.
- WY-5 Old faithful geyser from the Yellowstone National Park, a design adopted from a very popular 1934 postage stamp. Some members thought that this was a very successful design. Others thought that it would be hard to render the steam properly, which presently resembled dust or an explosion. It was also mentioned that the design was based on the stamp, whereas the actual appearance did not take into account movement because of the wind and other present-day localities.

Design WY-4 was preferred by the committee, receiving 18 out of a possible 27 points. The other voting results were: WY-1 with 14 points, WY-2 with 5 points, WY-3 with 0 points, and WY-5 with 11 points.

The three design proposals for Utah were generally seen as successful. There was some discussion about which design was most representative for modern-day Utah.

- UT-1 Two locomotives facing each other, with the golden spike between them. Mountains in the background, with CROSSROADS OF THE WEST above. This design represents one of the most significant historical events in American history; in 1869 the completion of the transcontinental railway in Utah brought the East and West together. Some members thought that the depiction of a historical event deserved support. However others thought that the depiction of the event was perhaps not clear enough and that the subject was too complex for a depiction on the quarter. There was some criticism of the details of the locomotives, which were not viewed as historically accurate. It was suggested that if this design were adopted, the words “TRANSCONTINENTAL RAILROAD” should appear beneath the scene, and the date and location of the event should also be indicated in the coin’s design.
- UT-2 The beehive, with flower, and THE BEEHIVE STATE. The beehive symbol has a strong connection with the state of Utah, and the design was seen as unproblematic if perhaps as uninspiring.
- UT-3 Winter sports representative by a female snow boarder in a mountain landscape, with “THE WORLD IS WELCOME”. The depiction of a young woman in a thoroughly modern sport was seen as a depiction of modern-day Utah. But members were concerned that the design did not translate well onto a coin.

Design UT-1 was narrowly preferred with 20 out of 27 points, with UT-2 receiving a close second place with 19 points. UT-3 received 11 points.

6. Kaarina Budow proceeded to present proposed designs for the obverse of the Presidential Dollar coin, to be issued beginning in 2007. Six templates, all based on the United States Mint's Presidential medal series, were presented. It was intended by the Mint that a single template should be used throughout the Presidential dollar series.

There was an initial discussion about the timeline for the series, which Mint employees said was tight. Several members of the committee expressed their extreme disappointment about the designs as a whole. It was then agreed to begin by discussing and evaluating the designs as currently presented. This agenda was established because the committee considered that part of its mandate was to comment on the specific designs presented, even though the use of the Presidential medal images was widely considered to be unsatisfactory. The committee agreed that after discussing the images presented by the Mint, it would return to the question of the overall suitability of the Mint's plan to use designs based on Presidential medals.

Most members believed that design 3, with its clear lettering, large portraits, and more modern look, was most acceptable of the alternatives presented.

The results of the votes were (out of a possible 27 points):

Design 1, with rope as decorative border: 3 points

Design 2, with beading as a decorative border: 6 points

Design 3, with larger portraits and a banner indicating order of service: 21 points

Design 4, with laurel, symbolizing victory: 3 points

Design 5, with laurel in a different arrangement : 3 points

Design 6, with laurel and oak, symbolizing virtue and strength: 5 points

Overall the portraits were considered by all members as boring and often too small. Members wanted to know why the Mint's Artistic Infusion Program was not involved in the design process. The committee was told that time constraints prevented the involvement of the artists of the Artistic Infusion Program. Ms. Budow also pointed out that the designs were based on official portraits of Presidents of their period, which had been used in the context of peace medals and other official purposes.

The committee took a lunch break at 12 noon.

7. The meeting continued at 1 pm with more questions about the artistic and numismatic merits of the Presidential dollar designs. There was general concern among members that such a program would be unpopular with more established coin collectors and a younger audience. Donald Scarinci made a passionate plea for a return to the drawing board by involving the artists from the artistic infusion program. He thought that the opportunity to make presidents of the past accessible

to the generation of the 21st century should not be missed. He predicted that the series would be a failure if it were to go ahead in its present design concepts. The committee members all concurred with his view.

8. By motion made by Mr. Scarinci and seconded by Mr. Billings, it was unanimously decided to recommend to the Secretary that the United States Mint should reconsider the design process by obtaining new images with the help of the Artistic Infusion Program. It was the sense of the committee that the aggressive timeline for producing Presidential dollars would still be feasible even with this additional solicitation of designs, and that a program of such importance would benefit from additional consideration of designs in the interest of presenting the best possible artwork.
9. There was some discussion of including on the reverse of the Presidential dollars, in addition to the Statue of Liberty, some aspect of the Presidency of the person depicted on the coin's obverse, to the extent allowable by the Presidential Dollar Coin Act. However, after it was pointed out that the reverse would be the unifying design element for this series, and that the clear legislative intent was for a dramatic rendition of the Statue of Liberty, the idea was dropped.
10. Designs for the Jamestown 400th Anniversary Commemorative Coin program were then presented by Ann Bailey, Products Manager, Sales and Marketing, of the United States Mint. This program will consist of a gold \$5 coin and a silver \$1 coin, issued in 2007.

Due to the large number of proposed designs for this program, the committee adopted a two-step procedure for its evaluation process. In an initial round, each member indicated whether or not each design should continue on for a more extensive discussion. The support of five members was necessary for a design to advance. Each of the designs chosen for advancement would then be discussed, and a vote taken on which should be recommended by the CCAC.

For the obverse of the \$5 gold coin three designs received sufficient support for consideration in a second round: GO-02 featuring Captain John Smith and Chief Powhatan, design GO-07 featuring John Smith by himself, and design GO-15 featuring the three ships of the expedition. Several members liked Design GO-15, but considered it more suitable as an image for a coin reverse. The committee's recommended design for the gold obverse is GO-02, which received six votes of a possible nine. Design GO-07 received three votes, and design GO-15 received 0 votes. The committee discussed moving "In God We Trust" to the reverse of the \$5 coin, but ultimately elected to recommend the design as presented.

Among the proposed gold reverse designs two received sufficient support for consideration in a second round: GR-02, featuring the Jamestown Memorial Church, and GR-09, featuring a Native American woman carrying corn. By a vote of 5-3 the committee recommended design GR-09. In addition, the committee voted 6-0 to recommend that the inscription "A Gift From Our Harvest" should be removed from the reverse, out of concern for historical

accuracy. The committee shared the recipient organization's preference that a female appear on at least one of the designs for this program.

For the silver obverse only one design received sufficient support to move forward: SO-03, showing three faces of diversity. The committee therefore recommends design SO-03 for the silver obverse. The committee also voted unanimously that the reference to "Founding" should be removed from the obverse. The committee desired that the coin should reflect the role of African-Americans in the development of Jamestown, but felt that the current inscription implies, incorrectly, that African-Americans were present at the time of the colony's founding in 1607.

For the silver reverse two designs received sufficient support for consideration in a second round: SR-02, featuring a Native American holding a bow and arrow, and SR-10, featuring the three ships of the expedition. Both images were considered acceptable, with the committee narrowly recommending SR-02 by a 5-4 vote.

10. John Warriner, Assistant Director, Bullion & International Operations, Manufacturing, of the United States Mint then presented proposed designs for the Buffalo 24-Karat Gold Bullion Coin. The legislation authorizing this program provides that James Earle Fraser's 1913 nickel design should be employed, with the designs before the committee modified slightly from the original in order to include the coin's denomination, weight, fineness, and the motto "In God We Trust."

After recommendation by Bill Fivaz, a motion was made by Donald Scarinci and seconded by Rita Laws to recommend obverse 24K-GO-5, which exactly duplicates Fraser's 1913 design, for the coin's obverse, and 24K-GR-1 for the reverse. The motion was passed unanimously.

The committee also recommends that the Buffalo Gold Bullion Coin should have the same textured fields as on the original "Type 1" nickel design of 1913, for both the proof and the uncirculated version. Mr. Warriner indicated that the fields would be textured, because the dies for the bullion coin would be based on the original Buffalo nickel dies, but that he would have to find out the technical feasibility of textured fields for the proof specimens.

Committee members expressed considerable enthusiasm for this program, considering it to be a success both conceptually and artistically.

11. The committee then received an update on legislative activity related to coins and medals from Joyce Harris, Acting Director, Legislative & Intergovernmental Affairs, of the United States Mint.
12. On motion by John Alexander, seconded by Joe Winter, the committee voted unanimously to adjourn. Chairman Mitch Sanders adjourned the meeting at 2:35 P.M.
13. The next CCAC meeting will be held at United States Mint headquarters in Washington, DC on Thursday, February 28, 2006.

